

1 GENE TANAKA, Bar No. 101423
gene.tanaka@bbklaw.com
2 SARAH CHRISTOPHER FOLEY, Bar No. 277223
sarah.foley@bbklaw.com
3 DAKOTAH BENJAMIN, Bar No. 316446
Dakotah.Benjamin@bbklaw.com
4 BEST BEST & KRIEGER LLP
2001 N. Main Street, Suite 390
5 Walnut Creek, California 94596
Tel: (925) 977-3300 Facsimile: (925) 977-1870
6

7 SHAWN HAGERTY, Bar No. 182435
shawn.hagerty@bbklaw.com
8 BEST BEST & KRIEGER LLP
655 West Broadway, 15th Floor
San Diego, California 92101
9 Tel: (619)-525-1300 Facsimile: (619)-233-6118

10 Attorneys for Respondent and Cross-Complainant
11 CITY OF SAN BUENAVENTURA

12 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
13 COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

14 SANTA BARBARA CHANNELKEEPER,
15 a California non-profit corporation,

16 Petitioner,

17 v.

18 STATE WATER RESOURCES
CONTROL BOARD, a California State
Agency;
19 CITY OF SAN BUENAVENTURA, a
California municipal corporation,
20 incorrectly named as CITY OF
21 BUENAVENTURA,

22 Respondents.

23 CITY OF SAN BUENAVENTURA, a
24 California municipal corporation,

25 Cross-Complainant

26 v.

27 DUNCAN ABBOTT, an individual, et al.

28 Cross-Defendants.

Case No. 19STCP01176

Judge: Honorable William F. Highberger

CROSS-COMPLAINANT CITY OF SAN
BUENAVENTURA'S FIRST
SUPPLEMENTAL DISCLOSURES

Action Filed: Sept. 19, 2014

Trial Date: Not Set

1 FIRST SUPPLEMENTAL INITIAL DISCLOSURES

2
3 Pursuant to California Civil Procedure Code section 842 and the Court's Order for Stay,
4 dated August 23, 2019, Defendant and Cross-Complainant City of San Buenaventura ("City")
5 makes the following First Supplemental Disclosures:

- 6
7 1. The name, address, telephone number, and email address of the party and the
8 party's attorney

9
10 City of San Buenaventura

11 Susan Rungren, srungren@cityofventura.ca.gov

12 501 Poli St.

13 Ventura, CA 93001

14 (805) 652-4523

15
16 Best Best & Krieger LLP

17 Gene Tanaka, gene.tanaka@bbklaw.com

18 Sarah Foley, sarah.foley@bbklaw.com

19 Dakotah Benjamin, dakotah.benjamin@bbklaw.com

20 2001 N. Main Street, Suite 390

21 Walnut Creek, CA 94596

22 (925) 977-3300

23
24 Best Best & Krieger LLP

25 Shawn Hagerty, shawn.hagerty@bbklaw.com

26 655 West Broadway, 15th Floor

27 San Diego, CA 92101

28 (619) 525-1300

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

2. The quantity of any groundwater extracted from the basin by the party and the method of measurement used by the party for each of the previous 10 years preceding the filing of the complaint

City extracts water from the Ventura River and/or the interconnected Upper Ventura River Groundwater Basin at its Foster Park facilities, including a subsurface intake and wells. The quantities City extracted for the past ten years are as follows:

- 2009 3,037 acre-feet (“af”)
- 2010 3,161 af
- 2011 3,428 af
- 2012 3,777 af
- 2013 2,173 af
- 2014 3,238 af
- 2015 1,298 af
- 2016 1,849 af
- 2017 3,647 af
- 2018 1,876 af

Method of measurement: water meters.

3. The type of water right or rights claimed by the party for the extraction of groundwater

City holds pueblo, treaty, pre-1914 appropriative, and/or prescriptive rights to surface water, subsurface underflow, and/or percolating groundwater in the Ventura River Watershed (“Watershed”).

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

4. A general description of the purpose to which the groundwater has been put

Ventura Water, a City Department and the City's municipal water supplier, uses water from the Ventura River and/or the interconnected Upper Ventura River Groundwater Basin to provide potable water service to a population of approximately 113,500 persons, and has approximately 32,000 service connections. The City's existing water service area includes all portions within the City limits, as well as portions of unincorporated Ventura County that meet the City's policy for water connections outside City limits.

5. The location of each well or other source through which groundwater has been extracted.

City extracts water from the Ventura River and/or the interconnected Upper Ventura River Groundwater Basin from its Foster Park Subsurface Intake and Nye Wells 7, 8, and 11, located at:
Ventura River at Foster Park
37 Casitas Vista Rd.
Ventura, CA 93001

6. The area in which the groundwater has been used

City water from the Ventura River and/or the interconnected Upper Ventura River Groundwater Basin is used in all areas within the City limits, as well as portions of unincorporated Ventura County that meet the City's policy for water connections outside City limits.

1 7. Any claims for increased or future use of groundwater

2
3 City is a successor to the Mission San Buenaventura and holds pueblo and/or
4 treaty water rights under the 1848 Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo, which gives it a
5 priority to use sufficient water from the Watershed to meet its present and future
6 needs.

7
8 City's pre-1914 appropriative right entitles it to 4,000 miner's inches
9 (approximately 72,400 af/year).

10
11 8. The quantity of any beneficial use of any alternative water use that the party
12 claims as its use of groundwater under any applicable law, including, but not
13 limited to, Section 1005.1, 1005.2, or 1005.4 of the Water Code.

14
15 Wastewater undergoes tertiary treatment to Title 22 standards at the City's Ventura
16 Water Reclamation Facility for use in outdoor irrigation to offset potable water
17 use. For example, in 2017, the City reclaimed 594.21 af in lieu of diversion.

18
19 9. Identification of all surface water rights and contracts that the party claims
20 provides the basis for its water right claims in the comprehensive adjudication

21
22 City holds a pueblo and/or treaty rights to take water from the Ventura River and
23 its interconnected groundwater basins.

24
25 Additionally, pursuant a 1923 deed from Southern California Edison Company,
26 City holds an appropriative right to 4,000 miner's inches (approximately 72,400
27 af/year), dating back to 1870. *See* VEN0003279, which City produced as part of
28 its Initial Disclosures, dated October 22, 2019.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

City holds a contractual water right with Casitas Municipal Water District.

10. The quantity of any replenishment of water to the basin that augmented the basin's native water supply.

None for the Upper Ventura River Groundwater Basin.

City claims a contractual right to the treated water discharged by the Ojai Valley Sanitary District into the Ventura River, which provides replenishment to the Ventura River and/or the Lower Ventura River Groundwater Basin.

11. The names, addresses, telephone numbers, and email addresses of all persons possessing information that supports the party's disclosures

Susan Rungren, P.E., Ventura Water, General Manager

c/o Best Best & Krieger LLP

Gene Tanka, gene.tanaka@bbklaw.com

2001 N. Main Street, Suite 390'

Walnut Creek, CA 94596

(925) 977-3300

City will identify additional individuals at the designated time for the exchange of expert witness information.

12. Any other facts that tend to prove the party's claimed water right

City's pre-1914 appropriative right entitles it to 4,000 miner's inches, and City's actual historical use and that of its predecessors, dating back to 1870, makes City

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

the most senior appropriative user in the Watershed.

With respect to City's pueblo right, City is a successor to the Mission San Buenaventura, which gives it a priority to use sufficient water from the Watershed to meet its existing and future needs.

Regarding City's prescriptive right, City has utilized water from the Watershed for more than five years prior to the filing of this Cross-Complaint. It has used the Watershed and/or its water for reasonable and beneficial purposes; and it has done so under a claim of right in an actual, open, notorious, exclusive, continuous, uninterrupted, hostile, adverse use and/or manner for a period of time of at least five years before filing this Cross-Complaint.

City's use of water from the Watershed is reasonable and beneficial because:

- (a) It provides domestic water service and the California Legislature has declared that "water for domestic purposes is the highest use of water and that the next highest use is for irrigation." Cal. Water Code § 106.
- (b) It encourages conservation of water by its users, does not waste water in its operations, and only uses water for municipal purposes.
- (c) It provides safe, clean, affordable, and accessible water.
- (d) It is exercising vested water rights.
- (e) While the Ventura River is a critical supply source for the City, the City's use accounts for a relatively small percent of the total water use in the Watershed by all parties.

City will further supplement its disclosure pursuant to California Civil Procedure Code section 842(d).

1 Dated: October 31, 2019

BEST BEST & KRIEGER LLP

2
3 By: *Gene Tanaka*

4 GENE TANAKA
5 SHAWN HAGERTY
6 SARAH CHRISTOPHER FOLEY
7 DAKOTAH BENJAMIN
8 Attorneys for Respondent and
9 Cross-Complainant
10 CITY OF SAN BUENAVENTURA
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

VERIFICATION


I, Susan Rungren, declare:

1. I am the General Manager of Ventura Water, a department of Cross-Complainant the City of San Buenaventura (“City”), and am authorized to make this verification for and on the City’s behalf.

2. I have read the City’s First Supplemental Disclosures, dated October 31, 2019, and know its contents, including any attachments. I am informed and believe, and on that ground allege that the matters stated in it are true.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on October 31, 2019, at Ventura, California.


Susan Rungren

LAW OFFICES OF
BEST BEST & KRIEGER LLP
2001 NORTH MAIN STREET, SUITE 390
WALNUT CREEK, CALIFORNIA 94596

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

PROOF OF SERVICE

I am a resident of the State of California and over the age of eighteen years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is Best Best & Krieger LLP, 2001 N. Main St. Suite 390, Walnut Creek, CA 94596. On October 31, 2019, I served the within document(s):

CROSS-COMPLAINANT CITY OF SAN BUENAVENTURA'S FIRST SUPPLEMENTAL DISCLOSURES

- by placing the document(s) listed above in a sealed envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid, in the United States mail at Walnut Creek, California addressed as set forth below. I am readily familiar with the firm's practice of collection and processing correspondence for mailing. Under that practice it would be deposited with the U.S. Postal Service on that same day with postage thereon fully prepaid in the ordinary course of business.
- I caused such envelope to be delivered via overnight delivery. Such envelope was deposited for delivery by United Parcel Service following the firm's ordinary business practices.
- by transmission via **E-Service to File & ServeXpress** to the person(s) set forth below. Local Rules of Court 2.10 (P).
- By e-mail or electronic transmission.** I caused the documents to be sent to the persons at the e-mail addresses listed below. I did not receive, within a reasonable time after the transmission, any electronic message or other indication that the transmission was unsuccessful.

Daniel Cooper
Cooper & Lewand-Martin, Inc.
1004B O'Reilly Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94129
Tel: (415) 360-2962
daniel@cooperlewand-martin.com

Matthew Bullock
Deputy Attorney General
California Department of Justice
Natural Resources Law Section
455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000
San Francisco, CA 94102-7004
Tel: (415) 510-3376
matthew.bullock@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for Petitioner and Plaintiff
Santa Barbara Channelkeeper

Attorneys for Respondent and Defendant State
Water Resources Control Board

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Marc N. Melnick
Deputy Attorney General
Attorney General's Office
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor
P.O. Box 70550
Oakland, CA 94612-0550
Tel: 510-879-0750
Marc.melnick@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for Respondent and Defendant
State Water Resources Control Board

Paul Blatz
Ryan Blatz
Blatz Law Firm
206 N. Signal St. Suite G
Ojai, CA 93023
Tel: (805) 646-3110
blatzlawfirm@gmail.com
ryan@ryanblatzlaw.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendants Troy
Becker, Janet Boulten, Michael Boulten,
Michael Caldwell, Joe Clark, Michael
Cromer; Linda Epstein, Etchart Ranch,
Lawrence Hartmann, Ole Konig, Krotona
Institute of Theosophy; Stephen Mitchell;
North Fork Springs Mutual Water Company,
Rudd Ranch, LLC; Shlomo Raz, Sylvia Raz,
Senior Canyon Mutual Water Company,
Siete Robles Mutual Water Company, Soule
Park Golf Course, Ltd., Telos, LLC, Victor
Timar, John Town and Trudie Town

Anthony Lee Francois
Jeremy Talcott
David Deerson
Pacific Legal Foundation
930 G Street
Sacramento, CA 95814-1802
Tel: (916) 419-7111
Fax: (916) 419-7111
alf@pacifical.org
TFrancois@pacifical.org
jtalcott@pacifical.org
ddeerson@pacifical.org

Attorney for Cross-Defendant Robin
Bernhoft

Edward J. Casey
Clynton Namuo
Alston & Bird LLP
333 South Hope Street, 16th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071
Tel: 213.576.1000
ed.casey@alston.com
clynton.namuo@alston.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendants Bentley Family
Limited Partnership and AGR Breeding, Inc.

William G. Short, Esq.
Law Offices of William G. Short
Post Office Box 1313
Ojai, California 93024-1313
Tel: (805) 490-6399
Fax: (805) 640-1940
billshortesq@me.com

Attorney for Cross-Defendant Robin Bernhoft

Robert Kwong
Dennis O. La Rochelle
A to Z Law Firm, LLP
300 Esplanade Dr Ste 2100
Oxnard, CA 93036
Tel: (805) 988-9886
rkwong@atozlaw.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendant Casitas
Municipal Water District

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Patrick Loughman
Cristian Arrieta
Lowthorp, Richards, McMillan, Miller &
Templeman
300 Esplande Drive, Suite 850
Oxnard, CA 93036
Tel: 805.804.3848
Ploughman@lrmmmt.com
Carrieta@lrmmmt.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendants Ernest Ford
and Tico Mutual Water Company

Lindsay F. Nielson
Law Office of Lindsay F. Nielson
845 E Santa Clara Street
Ventura, CA 93001
Tel: 805-658-0977
nielsonlaw@aol.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendant Meiners
Oaks Water District and Ventura River
Water District

Neal P. Maguire
Ferguson Case Orr Patterson LLP
1050 South Kimball Road
Ventura, CA 93004
Tel: (805) 659-6800
nmaguire@fcoplaw.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendant Rancho
Matilija Mutual Water Company

Gregory J. Patterson
Musick, Peeler & Garrett LLP
2801 Townsgate Road, Suite 200
Westlake Village, CA 91361
Tel: (805) 418-3103
Fax: (805) 418-3101
g.patterson@musickpeeler.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendants Robert C.
Davis, Jr., James Finch, Friend's Ranches, Inc.,
Topa Topa Ranch Company, LLC, The
Thacher School, Thacher Creek Citrus, LLC

Jeanne Zolezzi
Herum Crabtree Suntag
5757 Pacific Avenue, Suite 222
Stockton, CA 95207
Tel: (209) 472-7700
Fax: (209) 472.7986
jzolezzi@herumcrabtree.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendant Meiners Oaks
Water District and Ventura River Water
District

Thomas S. Bunn III
Elsa Sham
Lagerlof Senecal Gosney & Kruse LLP
301 N. Lake Avenue, 10th Floor
Pasadena, CA 91101-5123
Tel.: (626) 793-9400
Fax: (626) 793-5900
tombunn@lagerlof.com
esham@lagerlof.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendant St. Joseph's
Associates of Ojai, California, Inc.

1 Michael J. Van Zandt
Nathan A. Metcalf
2 Sean G. Herman
Hanson Bridgett LLP
3 425 Market Street, 26 Floor
San Francisco, CA 94105
4 Tel: 415-777-3200
Fax: 415-541-9366
5 mvanzandt@hansonbridgett.com
nmetcalf@hansonbridgett.com
6 sherman@hansonbridgett.com

7 Attorneys for Cross-Defendant Ventura
County Watershed Protection District

9 Joseph C. Chrisman
Hathaway, Perrett, Webster, Powers,
10 Chrisman & Gutierrez
5450 Telegraph Road
11 Ventura, CA 93003
(805) 644-7111
12 jchrisman@hathawaylawfirm.com

15 Attorneys for Cross-Defendant Wood-
Claeyssens Foundation

Scott Slater
Bradley Herrema
Christopher Guillen
Brownstein Hyatt Farber Schreck LLP
1021 Anacapa Street, 2nd Floor
Santa Barbara, CA 93101
Tel: (805) 963-7000
Fax: (805) 965-4333
sslater@bhfs.com
bherrema@bhfs.com
cguillen@bhfs.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendant Wood-
Claeyssens Foundation

David B. Cosgrove
Jeffrey M. Oderman
Douglas J. Dennington
Jeremy N. Jungreis
Rutan & Tucker, LLP
611 Anton Boulevard, Suite 1400
Costa Mesa, CA 92626-1931
Tel: 714-641-5100
Fax: 714-546-9035
dcosgrove@rutan.com
joderman@rutan.com
ddennington@rutan.com
jjungreis@rutan.com

Attorneys for Cross-Defendant Casitas
Municipal Water District


18 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the
19 above is true and correct.

21 Executed on October 31, 2019 at Walnut Creek, California.

22
23 

24 _____
Irene Islas

File & ServeXpress Transaction Receipt

File & ServeXpress Transaction ID: 64375726
Submitted by: Irene Islas, Best Best & Krieger LLP-Riverside
Authorized by: Gene Tanaka, Best Best & Krieger LLP-Riverside
Authorize and file on: Oct 31 2019 1:26PM PDT 

Court: CA Superior Court County of Los Angeles-eService
Division/Courtroom: N/A
Case Class: Civil- Channelkeeper vs State Water Resources Control Board (19STCP01176)
Case Type: Civil
Case Number: 19STCP01176
Case Name: Channelkeeper, Santa Barbara vs State Water Resources Control Board et al

Transaction Option: Serve Only - Public
Billing Reference: 82470.00018
Read Status for e-service: Not Purchased

Documents List

1 Document(s)

Attached Document, 13 Pages Document ID: 84460241

Document Type:	Access:	Statutory Fee:	Linked:
Discovery	Secure Public	\$0.00	

Document title:

Cross-Complainant City of San Buenaventura's First Supplemental Disclosures

Expand All

Sending Parties (1)

Party	Party Type	Attorney	Firm	Attorney Type
City of San Buena Ventura	Defendant	Tanaka, Gene	Best Best & Krieger LLP-Riverside	Attorney in Charge

Recipients (75)


- Service List (75)
- Additional Recipients (0)

Case Parties

Close

[About File & ServeXpress \(http://www.fileandserveexpress.com/about-us\)](http://www.fileandserveexpress.com/about-us) | [Resource Center \(https://resourcecenter.fileandserveexpress.com/resourcecenterwebui/default.aspx?ut=FC\)](https://resourcecenter.fileandserveexpress.com/resourcecenterwebui/default.aspx?ut=FC) | [FAQs \(/FSXMasterPage/FAQ\)](#) | [Terms & Conditions \(https://secure.fileandserveexpress.com/agreement.htm\)](https://secure.fileandserveexpress.com/agreement.htm) | [Privacy \(http://www.fileandserveexpress.com/privacy\)](http://www.fileandserveexpress.com/privacy)

Client Support

 12888-520-8587 File & ServeXpress, LLC. All rights reserved.

 support@fileandserve.com (mailto:support@fileandserve.com)

 Chat Online