			E-SERVICE 67199593
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15		THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA F LOS ANGELES Case No. 19STCPO1176 Judge: Honorable William F. Highberger NOTICE FOR JOINDER MOTION IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR JUDGEMENT ON THE PLEADINGS BY ANDREW WHITMAN Date: December 20, 2021	67199593 Dec 29 2021 08:40AM
16 17 18	CITY OF SAN BUENAVENTURA, a	Action filed: Sept. 19, 2014 Trial Date : February 14, 2022	
18	Respondent De fondan t		
 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 	CITY OF SAN BUENVENTURA, a Californi municipal corporation, incorrectly named as CITY OF BUENA VENTURA, Cross-Complaint v. Duncan Abbott, an individual. Et al., Cross-Defendants	a	

Page 1 of 3

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that Cross-Defendants, Dale G. and Patricia Givner, do hereby
 join in, and provide this Notice of Motion regarding, the Motion for judgment on the Pleadings
 of Cross-Defendants Andrew K. Whitman, Heidi A. Whitman, Nancy L. Whitman Family Trust,
 to be heard on January 18, 2022 at ? a.m., or as soon thereafter as the matter may be heard, in
 Department 10 of the above-entitled court located at 312 North Spring Street, Los Angeles,
 California.

Cross-Defendants, Dale G. and Patricia Givner, by this Notice of Joinder and Notice of Motion
regarding the above referenced motion, will and do hereby move, pursuant to Code of Civil
Procedure section 438 and other applicable statutes and case law, for an Sixth Cause of Action of
the Third Amended Cross-Complaint:

The Sixth Cause of Action for Comprehensive Adjudication of the Third Amended
 Cross-complaint fails to state facts sufficient to constitute a cause of action and is beyond
 the jurisdiction of the court to issue an order adjudication groundwater rights as against a
 property owner overlying groundwater of the Upper Ventura River Groundwater Basin
 (UVRGB). (Code Civ. Proc. Sec. 438 (c)(1)(B)(I) and (ii).

The joinder in the motion is based upon the Notice of Motion and Memorandum of Points and
Authorities filed by the Whitman Cross-Defendants, the court's complete files and such other
matters as may be filed with the court.

Dated:

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Decenber 26, 2021

Dale G. and Patricia Givner

Patrice Dines

Page 2 of 3

MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND SUTHORITIES

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

23

24

25

26

27

28

A PARTY MAY JOIN IN ANOTHER PARTY'S Motion for Judgment on the Pleadings so long as the joining party timely serves and files a Notice of Joinder and articulates all facts necessary to the motion. Cross-Defendants, Dale G. and Patricia Givner, are timely filing and serving this Notice of Joinder/Notice of Motion regarding the Motion for Judgment on the Pleadings of Cross-Defendants Andrew k. Whitman, Heidi A. Whitman, Nancy L. Whitman and the John R. And Nancy L. Whitman Family Trust.

Joinder is proper because Joining Cross-Defendants are similarly situated to the 8 moving party as a cross-defendant sued solely based upon ownership of property overlying 9 the Upper Ventura River Groundwater Basin (UVRGB). The Third Amended Complaint 10 11 (3ACC) does not assert facts establishing that the joining parties have ever extracted groundwater from the UVRGB and even if the 3ACC had stated such facts, the 3ACC fails 12 to state facts showing that the joining cross-defendants used groundwater in a manner that 13 14 was not reasonable or beneficial. Furthermore, the 3ACC fails to state facts, demonstrating the city of San Buenaventura has standing the assert the sixth cause of 15 action for a comprehensive adjudication in that it fails to demonstrate via material fact that 16 the CITY has any claim to groundwater rights of the UVRGB. 17 For the reasons stated above and in Motion for Judgement on the Pleadings by the 18 Whitman cross-defendants, the Givner cross-defendants respectfully request that said 19

Motion, as Joined in by the Givner cross-defendants, be granted and that judgement be
entered in favor of Givner cross-defendants and against the CITY on the sixth cause of
action of 3Acc.

Dated: December 20, 2021

Dale G. Givner black & lam

Patricia Givner Valuia Diconez

Page 3 of 3